



Performance Evaluation Of Area Cleanliness Company Using Balanced Score Card (*Analytical Study Of Waste Management In Bandung City*)

Betty Wargadinata¹, Eman Sulaeman², Riyan Prasetyo³, Restu Budi Wahyudin⁴, Syahdias Siregar⁵

^{1,2,3,4,5}Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Administrasi, Bandung, Indonesia

E-mail: bettywargadinata@stiabandung.ac.id, emansulaeman170474@stiabandung.ac.id,
riyanandre@stiabandung.ac.id, restubudiw12@stiabandung.ac.id, syahdiass@stiabandung.ac.id

Article Info	Abstract
Article History Received: 2022-06-20 Revised: 2022-07-28 Published: 2022-08-05 Keywords: <i>Performance; Balanced Scorecard.</i>	In the current era of globalization, every business entity, including PD Cleaning needs to be managed professionally. For this reason, improving organizational performance, alignment of organizational goals and individual goals is very important. For this reason, a comprehensive performance appraisal system is needed. The Balanced Scorecard is an alternative performance measurement that combines financial and non-financial performance measures. This measurement is the result of a process based on the mission and strategy of a company. This study aims to determine how the performance of PD Hygiene, using the concept of the Balanced Scorecard, by measuring four aspects, namely financial perspective, customer perspective, internal business process perspective, learning and growth perspective. From the research results it is known that, the learning and growth perspective shows that employee productivity is still low, the percentage of skilled employee training every year is still low. This triggers the level of employee satisfaction is still not satisfied. Internal business perspective, the level of service has not satisfied customers.
Artikel Info	Abstrak
Sejarah Artikel Diterima: 2022-06-20 Direvisi: 2022-07-28 Dipublikasi: 2022-08-05 Kata kunci: <i>Pertunjukan; Kartu Skor Berimbang.</i>	Di era globalisasi saat ini, setiap badan usaha termasuk PD Cleaning perlu dikelola secara profesional. Untuk itu, peningkatan kinerja organisasi, keselarasan tujuan organisasi dan tujuan individu menjadi sangat penting. Untuk itu diperlukan sistem penilaian kinerja yang komprehensif. Balanced Scorecard adalah pengukuran kinerja alternatif yang menggabungkan ukuran kinerja keuangan dan non-keuangan. Pengukuran ini merupakan hasil dari suatu proses yang didasarkan pada misi dan strategi suatu perusahaan. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui bagaimana kinerja PD Hygiene, dengan menggunakan konsep Balanced Scorecard, dengan mengukur empat aspek yaitu perspektif keuangan, perspektif pelanggan, perspektif proses bisnis internal, perspektif pembelajaran dan pertumbuhan. Dari hasil penelitian diketahui bahwa, perspektif pembelajaran dan pertumbuhan menunjukkan bahwa produktivitas pegawai masih rendah, persentase pelatihan pegawai terampil setiap tahun masih rendah. Hal ini memicu tingkat kepuasan karyawan masih belum puas. Perspektif bisnis internal, tingkat pelayanan belum memuaskan pelanggan.

I. INTRODUCTION

Reform in Indonesia is a movement that calls for changes in the life of society, nation and state towards a better, constitutionally. Democratization in government is realized by decentralization. Decentralization is the delegation of responsibility for policy, fiscal and political administration from the central government to local governments (Adisasmita, 2011:16). Still according to Adisasmita (2011) that among the objectives of decentralization include; political, administrative, fiscal, and economic decentralization. The Regency/City Regional Government is obliged to carry out public services in accordance with the authority/government affairs submitted to the regional management. Environmental management affairs, which are

related to public services, are the provision of housing and settlement infrastructure. Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs No. 9 of 2009, concerning Guidelines for the Delivery of Housing and Settlement Infrastructure, Facilities and Utilities in the Regions, in Article 8, includes; road network, sewerage, rainwater, and garbage dumps.

Provision of waste disposal sites, not only providing trash cans, but also includes overall waste management. Waste management is a systematic, comprehensive, and sustainable activity that includes waste reduction and handling. Based on this, the principles and objectives of waste management, the Regional Government must implement it systematically, and sustainably, covering various aspects; (a)

institutional, regulatory, (c) technical and operational, (d) financing, and (e) the role of the community. The five aspects of waste management cannot stand alone, but must be implemented in an integrated and comprehensive manner and are interrelated with one another. In the current era of autonomy and globalization, in general, local governments have not been able to implement an integrated and comprehensive waste management system. Therefore, the problems faced are increasingly complex, covering various disciplines.

In detail, the development of the volume of waste in Bandung City from 2019-2020, can be seen in the following table 1.

Table 1. Development of generation & volume of transported waste in the city of Bandung

No	Year	Total Population (Soul)	rise Tons*)	Trans ported	Realiza- tion (%)
1	2017	2,329,931	522,214	347,027	66.5
2	2018	2,424,957	528,795	375,658	71.0
3	2019	2,602,848	560,523	357,267	63.7
4	2020	2,748,733	601,973	389,459	64.7

Source: PD. Cleanliness of Bandung (2022)

Based on these data, the waste that has not been transported by PD Bersih reaches 30 -35%, of the total generation, this is influenced by the limited means of transportation and the distance to the final disposal site, which is quite far. However, from the aspect of the TPA area of 25 Ha, based on calculations, it can accommodate all the waste generated by the City of Bandung every day. As for the waste that is not transported, it is still in the TPS, used by the community (recycled and composted), and some is thrown anywhere. Likewise, increasing community participation has not yet become the focus of PD Hygiene. The management is still concentrating on the technical aspects of operations, in which the Cleanliness PD is responsible for carrying out road sweeping and transporting waste from TPS to TPA. In order to increase the effectiveness of hygiene PD, a comprehensive performance evaluation is very important, as a material for future planning. These measurements are not only focused on financial aspects, but must measure non-financial aspects. One of the measurement models that assesses organizational performance comprehensively is the Balanced Score Card (BSC). Based on the identification of problems and phenomena that occur, this research is proposed to examine the performance evaluation of a cleaning area

company using a balanced score card in the city of Bandung. As for the focus of the problems in this study are; how is the performance of the regional cleaning company in the city of Bandung using the balanced score card model? This is also to see the relationship between financial and non-financial performance in the perspective of customers and internal business as well as learning and growth.

II. METHOD

This study uses a qualitative method with a participatory observation approach which is carried out by direct observation through interviews. Sources of data in this study is primary data conducted by interviewing officials in the PD environment, cleanliness of Bandung City. The sampling technique in selecting resource persons for the perspective of public customers is the snowball technique, which is selecting resource persons who have rare characteristics and additional units indicated by previous respondents. Determination of resource persons using this technique is carried out in stages and carried out in the Andir sub-district with 8 locations. In addition to interview techniques, literature review and documents that are in PD. The cleanliness of the city of Bandung is also a complement in this research.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

From the survey results, the respondents obtained the following percentages:

Table 1. Composition of PD employees, Cleanliness by Position

NO	POSITION	AMOUNT	%
1	Directors	2	0.13
2	Head of Division / Unit	12	0.76
3	Section Head / Young Researcher and Supervisor	54	3.42
4	Head of Affairs	55	3.48
5	Field supervisor	55	3.48
6	Administrative staff/executive	152	9.63
7	Collectors and Registrar	143	9.06
8	Street sweeper	629	39.84
9	Market Sweeper	44	2.79
10	Landfill sweeper	3	0.19
11	Driver	152	9.63
12	Transport Crew	209	13.24
13	Heavy equipment operator	3	0.19
14	Garbage Press Machine Operator	5	0.32
15	Workshop Officer	32	2.03
16	Landfill Officer	13	0.82

17	Guard Officer	16	1.01
TOTAL NUMBER		1579	100.00

Source: HR Division PD. Cleanliness

Based on the composition of education, senior high school reached 29%, and D3 to S1 reached 5.51%, and S2 was only 0.17%. Based on these data, the authors interpret that the company has not been able to improve employee education. Based on the results of interviews with the Head of the Sub Division of Employee Planning and Development, stated that: The company has not been able to finance employees to continue their education to the next level. In 2000 there were several people who took education to the D3 level, at the Public Works Education Institute (LPPU) at the expense of the Ministry. Based on the age of the respondents, it was found that the PD cleaning staff were in the age group: 42-47 years (25.27%), before retirement 48-53 years (22.23%), and 36-41 years (20.46%). The retirement age group generally works in regional operations, namely 93 people in the West Bandung operational area, and 90 people in South Bandung. Employees who are nearing retirement age generally work in operational areas as drivers and transport crews. To measure the performance of PD Hygiene, in accordance with the BSC framework, the authors translate the strategic objectives, based on the following formula:

Table 2. Outcome Measures and Performance Measures

Strategic Goals		Strategic Size
		Yield Size (Lag Indicators)
<i>Shareholder Value</i>		
S1	ROI Growth	Increased rate of return on investment
S2	Revenue Growth	Increased Income
<i>Firm Equity</i>		
F1	Increased community participation	Reduced waste generation from the source by 20%
F2	Private partnership	Increasing companies that cooperate
<i>Organizational Capital</i>		
O1	Increased collection facilities & infrastructure	The condition of the road is clean from garbage
O2	Improved transportation facilities and infrastructure	Increased volume of transported waste Clean TPS Condition
O2	Technology utilization	The establishment of PLTSA
<i>Human Capital</i>		
H1	Increased Personnel Capability	Operational revenue per employee
H2	Increased Personnel Commitment	High operational employee commitment

Source: Mulyadi (2001)

From the results of interviews, in general, the informants stated that: "During our work at PD

Hygiene, we have never transferred to another field". This opinion was reinforced by a structural official from the source: "Employee transfers for the implementers have never been carried out, so there are employees who from starting to work until retiring work in one field. This will have an impact on employee performance." Based on these conditions, the authors interpret that the placement of employees in the same place can have a positive or negative impact on increasing employee competence and performance. A positive impact will occur for employees who are committed to increasing their competence. In this study, the authors interviewed employees who work in the technical, workshop and administration fields to determine their commitment to improving their competence. From the interview results, the interviewees stated: "As an employee with a vocational education background, working in the workshop section from the beginning until now, has made my expertise increase. At first I was only able to do one job, namely welding. After working for almost twenty years, my welding technical skills have improved, now I am able to make one 10 M3 container unit in 1 week. If there is no work to repair or make containers, I always take part in the repair of the LH truck, which is damaged. By frequently participating in repairing LH trucks, I finally became able to do it. This ability is for provision when I retire,

Employees' awareness to increase their capacity, both to increase skills and increase formal education is not owned by all employees. This can be seen from the current educational qualifications of employees, employees with high school education reach 29%, D3 to S1 reach 5.51%, and only 0.17% for Masters. The majority of employees with elementary and non-elementary school education reached 45.7%, and until retirement, the education of these employees did not increase. Based on these data the authors interpret that the company has not been able to improve the quality of employees, both formal education and skills education. From the results of interviews with other sources in the field of HR stated: The company has not been able to finance employees to continue their education to the next level. In 2019 there were several people who took education to the D3 level, To achieve a productive and cost-effective process, according to Yasin's opinion, according to the author of PD, cleanliness needs to manage organizational resources well. Thus the company needs to be supported by employees who have the capability and commitment. In this regard, PD

Cleanliness needs to improve the knowledge and skills of employees. The program is intended to produce competent and committed employees to realize the company's vision. However, until now, the strategic goal of improving managerial quality has not been translated into programs and activities to improve the quality of employees on an ongoing basis as needed.

Table 3. Mapping of performance outcome measures based on the BSC perspective

Pers- pective	Bud- get Pers - pecti ve Wei ght	Strategy Goal	Target	Real- ization	Score
Financ e	10		9.60	9.20	10.87
		Revenue Growth	34.2	19.50	
Custo mer	0.5	a) Increased public awareness in paying the tariff for cleaning services	0.46	0.34	0.37
			34.2	19.50	
		b) Reduced waste generation	20	32	
Intern al Busin ess Proce ss	88.5	c) The condition of the roads is clean from garbage	89.73	89.38	88.15
		d) Increased volume of transported waste	100		
		e) Increase the number of transportation fleets	1100	1060	
			4	4	
		f) Increased number of TPS3 RTPS Repair	5	3	
			5	5	
Learni ng and Growt h	1	a) Increased managerial capacity of waste management in the management of regional companies.	0.98	0.68	0.69
				50	
			75		
		b) Increased knowledge, technical capabilities and skills for the ranks of PD Hygiene employees in terms of the latest technology			

The performance of the learning and growth perspective is not yet optimal, causing the inability to support the performance of internal business processes. The budget support provided was quite large, reaching 89.30%, and the realization was 89.90%, of the total expenditure, with a total score of 88.15. The achievement of the weight is almost close to the set weight of

88.5. Although the realization exceeds the budget, the performance on internal business processes has not been able to create customer satisfaction from the customer perspective. Excess budget realization is evidence that the budget from a learning and growth perspective is used to cover internal business processes. Likewise with the customer perspective budget, to increase public awareness on the customer's perspective, has not been the focus of management. This can be seen from the small budget of 0, 48% and realization reached 0.34% of the total budget, with a total score of 0.37, not yet reaching the weighted score set according to the budget, namely 0.5. Besides the budget, the qualifications of HR in the field of Public Relations are also not optimal to become the company's marketing team.

IV. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

A. Conclusion

Based on description in chapter IV, evaluating the performance of PD Hygiene in waste management in the city of Bandung, using a balance scorecard, the authors conclude as follows:

1. Learning and growth perspective

Not optimalThe productivity of PD Bersih's employees will affect the various implementations of internal business processes in improving services. The current service is not in line with customer expectations, so that in the end it will affect the achievement of strategic goals from a financial perspective.

2. Internal business perspective

Internal business perspective, is the core of the implementation of the main tasks and functions of PD. Cleanliness. The indicators used to achieve these goals are:

- The condition of the road is clean from garbage, the condition of pro-tocol roads is clean of garbage, while for environmental roads, road sweep-ing is assisted by outsourced person-nel stationed in urban villages.
- Increased volume of transported was-te, the volume of transported waste has not increased, only 1000-1100 tons/day. The addition of the trans-portion fleet and transportation infrastructure has not been able to increase the volume of transported waste. This is due to the insufficient number of vehicles, the volume of waste continues to increase in line with economic growth. Thus, the

targets that have been set have not been achieved.

- c. The number of integrated polling stations has not increased, there are only 12 polling stations spread over several locations.
- d. Customer Perspective, the strategy drawn up in order to increase the company's equity (Firm Equity), PD Hygiene has been customer oriented.
- e. Financial perspective
- f. Financial performance that continues to lose from year to year has an impact on the services provided that are not optimal, as part of environmental protection and management. It is quite difficult for PD Cleanliness to realize its vision. The vision has not been realized, because the internalization of the vision has not been understood by all stakeholders

B. Saran

Based on the conclusions of the research, the authors recommend:

1. Learning and Growth Perspective
 - a) The new directors must be visionary and innovative in building the company professionally.
 - b) PD hygiene management must implement "Change Management", in managing organizational resources. Change management can be done through the implementation of "Strategic Management System", includes (1) program-ming system; (2) budgeting system; (3) implementation system; (4) monitoring system, (5) evaluation and reporting system, holistically and integrated.
2. Business perspective
Lowering the weight of the budget from 88.5%, to 70%, of the total budget, in the context of financing efficiency, the efficiency can be done through putilization of technology and mechanization of operational tools.
3. Customer Perspective
Increase the weight of the budget from 0.5% to 10% (Rangkuti, 2013:97-98). The increase in the budget is needed to increase public awareness, through strategic "marketing management". The task of Public Relations is not only to provide socialization that seems to fall out of obligation but must be carried out con-

tinuously with the right method according to customer segmentation.

4. Financial Perspective

The weight of the budget for the financial perspective, according to the author, is currently appropriate, at 10%, of the total budget, in supporting the implementation of the other 3 (three) perspectives.

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, Nurmadi. 2014. Fourth Edition Revised Printing Urban Management; Actors, Organizations, Management of Urban and Metropolitan Areas in Indonesia, Yogyakarta: Synergy Publishing.
- Amen Single Wijaya,. 2003. Performance Measurement with Balanced Scorecard. Jakarta: Harvarindo.
- Andi Prastowo,. 2010. Mastering Qualitative Research Data Collection Techniques. Yogyakarta : Diva Press.
- Annual Report on Billing for the period 2008 to 2013.
- Anwar Prabu Mangkunegara. 2005, Behavior and Organizational Culture, first printing, Publisher: Youth Rosda Karya, Malang.
- Dougall. Mc. R. Forbes. 2010. Integrated Solid Waste Management: A Life Cycle Inventory. USA : Blackwell Science Ltd.
- Armstrong. 2006. A Handbook Of Human Resource Management Practice. Tenth Edition. London: Cambridge University Press.
- Bandung City Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMD) 2014-2018.
- cashmere. 2009. Analysis of Financial Statements. Edition 1, 2nd printing. Jakarta :Rajawali Pers.
- Daily Thoughts of the People 23 May 2014.
- Daily Thoughts of the People, December 19, 2014
- Economics. Jakarta : University of Indonesia.
- Enri Damanhuri, et al. 2005. Evaluation of Waste Recycling Potential in Bandung Municipal Solid Waste. Journal of Environment and Waste Management. vol x. Nox, xxx

- Freddy Rangkuti, 2013. SWOT Balance Scorecard: Techniques for Developing Effective Corporate Strategies plus Ways to Manage Performance and Risk. Fourth printing. Jakarta, Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Gareth R Jones. 2007. Organizational Theory, Design, and Change. New Jersey : Pearson Education
- Gita pratiwi 2013. Daily Koran Sindo, Saturday, December 21, 2013.
- Haris Herdiansyah,. 2010. Qualitative Research Methodology For Social Sciences. Jakarta: Salemba Hamanika.
- Independent Auditor's Report on the Financial Statements of the Bandung City Cleanliness PD, 2008 to 2014.
- Inna Savova (2014). Kompas Daily 4 February 2014
- Irham Fahmi, 2011. Performance Management, Theory and Applications. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Jeff, Davidson. 2002. The Complete Ideal's Guide: Change Management. Translated by Dudy Priatna. Jakarta: Prenada Media.
- John Cresswell W. 2009. Research Design Qualitativ, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. Third Edition. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Jonathan Sarwono. 2006. Quantitative & Qualitative Research Methods. Yogyakarta:Graha Ilmu..
- Kompas Daily 24 April 2014.
- Laura. J Weber. 2002. Solid Waste Handbook, New York: St. Regis Mohawk Tribe, Akwesane,.
- Law No. 18 of 2008 concerning Waste Management. Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government.
- Law No. 32 of 2004 concerning Regional Government in conjunction with Law No. 12 of 2008.
- Law No. 5 of 1974 concerning Regional Government. Law No. 22 of 1999 concerning Regional Government.
- Lexy J Meleong. 2012. Qualitative Research Methodology, Bandung: PT Pemuda Rosdakarya.
- LP3E. Faculty of Economics, Padjadjaran University, 2010. Performance Evaluation Study of Regional Owned Enterprises (BUMD) Bandung City, Final Report.
- M. Natsir. 2003. Research Methods. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Mahmuddin Yasin. 2012. Building a Cultured Organization- BUMN Study. Jakarta : Expose (PT Mizan Publica).
- Mayor Regulation No. 316 of 2013 concerning Waste Management Service Tariffs "Corporate Plan" for Cleaning Area Companies 2012-2016
- Michael D Myers. 2013. Qualitative Research in Business & Management. Second Edition, London: Sage Publications Ltd. Moelyono, Djokosantoso, 2004. Reinvention, Four Strategies to Build a World-Class State-Owned Enterprise. Jakarta : Elex Media Komputindo, Gramedia,.
- Minister of Home Affairs Regulation No. 9 of 2009 concerning Guidelines for the Delivery of Housing and Settlement Infrastructure, Facilities and Utilities in the Regions
- Moh Tika Pabundu, 2008, Organizational Culture and Corporate Performance Improvement, Second Edition. Jakarta: Earth Literacy.
- Muhadjir Noeng. 2000. Qualitative Research Methodology, Edition IV. Yogyakarta : Rake Sarasin.
- Mulyadi, 2001. Balanced Scorecard, Contemporary Management Tool for Multiplying Corporate Financial Performance, Second Edition First Printing. Jakarta : Salemba Empat.
- Nigel King and Christine Horrocks. 2010. Interviews In Qualitative Research. First Published. London : Sage Publications Ltd.
- Paul. R. Niven. 2008. Balanced Scorecard. Step -

- By – Step For Government and NonProfit Agencies. Second Edition. New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., Hoboken, Payaman, J Simanjuntak. 2005. Management and Performance Evaluation. Faculty of
- PD Hygiene Performance Report 2013.
- Rahardjo Adisasmita. 2011, Local Government Management. Makassar: Graha Ilmu.
- Regional Regulation No. 09 of 2011 concerning Waste Management.
- Regional Regulation No. 14 of 2011 concerning Regional Cleanliness Companies in the city of Bandung.
- Robert S Kaplan. and David P. Norton. 2000. Balance Scorecard Implementing Strategy into Action, Translated by Peter R. Yosi Pasla from Balance Scorecard: Translating Strategy Into Action (1996). Jakarta: Erlangga..
- Scorecard with Six Sigma for Business and Government Organizations. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Solid Waste and Emergency Response. Singgih, L. Moses, et al, (2001), "Measurement and Analysis of Performance Using the Balanced Scorecard Method,
- Stephen P. Robbins. 1994. Organization Theory: Structure, Design & Application. Translated By Yusuf Udaya from Organization Theory: Structure, Design And Application (1990). Jakarta: Arcan..
- Sugiyono. 2010. Quantitative, Qualitative, and R&D Research Methods. Bandung : Alfabeta.
- The Final Report of the 2015 Bandung City Waste Management Business Study.
- True Kuncoro. 2004. Integrated Waste Management With Node System, Sub Point,Center Point. Yogyakarta Kanisius.
- Ulber Silalahi,. 2010. Social Research Methodology. Bandung : Refika Aditama.
- Vincent Gasperz,. 2005. Integrated Performance Management System: Balanced
- Wahyudin Zarkasyi. 2008. Good Corporate Governance, in Manufacturing, Banking, and Other Financial Services Business Entities. First print. Bandung : Alfabeta,
- Waluyo. 2007. Public Management Concept Application and Implementation in the implementation of regional autonomy Bandung: Mandar Maju